Affordable Housing Taskforce  
March 18, 2022, 2pm to 3:30pm

**Meeting Location**  
Sentinel Building  
320 N. Commerce Park Loop  
Tucson, AZ 85745

| Members Present                      | Betty Villegas | David Godlewski | Liz Morales  
|--------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------|-----------|
| Mark Clark                           | Maryann Beering | Megan Heddings | Tom Litwicki  
| Corky Poster                         | Dennis Regnier | Jenifer Chancay | Kim Fitch  
| Maggie Amado-Tellez                   | Joy Taylor    | Ann Chenecka    |           |

**Minutes**

**Charge:** The Affordable Housing Taskforce was empaneled by the County Administrator for the purpose of informing the Board’s actions and policies to improve housing affordability across Pima County.

- Highlight success stories, and identify evidence-based and promising practices that should be considered in Pima County
- Make recommendations that will meaningfully increase availability of affordable housing within metro and rural Pima County
- Identify public/private collaborative pathways to improve housing affordability
- Recommend a new charter for the Pima County Housing Commission that will strengthen the Board’s role in housing affordability

I. **Welcome:** Tom Litwicki, CEO of OPCS & Task Force Chair, Tom welcomed the task force members and guests. Tom recognized that member time is valuable and thanked them for attending the in person meeting.

Dr. Garcia kicked off the session and housing affordability seeing what the city had in mind and administration wanted to see how to build upon the issue. MAP study was a joint study and informs the question of housing affordability. How to turn all of the data into action? Dr. Garcia identified the various issues task force to help strategize ideas that arise as housing issues arise. Goal tap into the intelligence and try to emerge the best ideas that we could to move the ideas forward by putting them in front of the board of supervisors.

Robin started off the initial activities. Pathways to viable outcomes and reviewed the task force road map. Next meeting move into stakeholders and develop the viable recommendations to move things forward. Robin reviewed the values activity from last meeting and based on the remaining activity the teams will review their meeting packets and start the process of pulling pertinent data from the current reports. Identify viable recommendations, insights, and look at data snapshots and pull from that data.

II. **Community Agreements & Recommendation Priorities,** Robin reviewed the per-meeting homework and started the small group work to identify community agreements for task force charter and shared priorities for task force recommendations.

**Group report out for Community Agreements:** Equity, fairness – value differences; value each person/contributor; openness to dialogue, respect to build trust, connect, allow all to express their views, intentionally inclusive, use active listening, honesty, shared goals, shared
accomplishments, consistency, open to diverse policies, concise and clear, make space take space.

**Group report out for Recommendation Priorities:** Identify the gaps and obstacles, identify the resources, identify accumulate date and research, operate with economic realism, equitable outcomes, culturally appropriate, same access to information, inclusion and equity, practice endure, affordability, concrete plans and progress, realistic goals for realistic problems, shared goals and honesty in the process, practical solutions.

*** III. Best Practices and Examples of Recommendation Priorities:*** small groups reviewed key reports on housing in Pima County and identified relevant demonstrations of Task Force priorities:

**PCHIP** – possible PCHIP goals how to measure output vs. outcomes; equity, public input, data, outcome (action oriented); recognize nontraditional; housing first, homelessness, health lens, increase supply both rental and ownership, evidence based practices. Problematic – the PCHIP goals are hard to measure and is going to take time to see outcomes.

**Comprehensive Plan/Housing Element:** Pima Prospers plan, showed the land use of the plan, previous plans, sustainability plans, infrastructure, social elements, parks and trails, economic development; Housing – accessory dwelling units, 2nd kitchens, etc., infill redevelopment reuse. Implemented items that don’t have affordable housing.

**Eviction Report:** need to focus on prevention of eviction, adequate rental assistance is key, lots of policy recommendations across entities so need cooperation and shared values across entities. Challenges bureaucratic, affordability dollars, approving, report was done in the early days of the health pandemic so if things are working they should be kept moving forward.

**Impediments:** community education needs attention, concentration issue – harder to find land to build affordable housing, more robust monitoring, developer incentives

*** IV. Data Review to Identify Desirable Pathways:** Small group work with information from panelists, market segments, and local reports to explore program, policy, regulation, legal and finance pathways that align with task force priorities.

**Group 1:** removing barriers need to revisit rezoning, focus and emphasis on affordability and health, development approval less confrontational, focus on solution, evaluate how to streamline the process recognize timeline of process, impact fees, length of time to process, major streets and lots, identify county owned property, emphasis on childcare and quality jobs, rely on subject matter experts to develop the process and reevaluate the unified code.

**Group 2:** keeping people in their homes right now, using existing model, density and access to services, access to resources, increasing density of the infill, parking lots for development, reuse as another option like current hotel usage, look at the rezoning process (commercial building) land exchange, codes – change the process, change the BOS codes

**Group 3:** Any land should be looked at, seniors and families all populations require housing, identify strategies to increase affordable housing and communicate with the neighborhood and current opposition regarding affordable housing developments.

**Group 4:** number evictions trying to get into housing, need dollars for voucher, reduce regulations and barriers to money goes where it needs to go, someone has to control housing nonpublic entity and should include opportunities for individuals returning to society, can’t wait on the market prices.
V. **Wrap up and Next Steps:** Angie stated that we talked about desirable pathways and we have a definition of strategies and priorities for how and where to act. Will address that with the data provided today. Next two sessions will get into viable and achievable actions in the short and long term. Feasible is something we can do. Viable is something we can do and are sustainable. April and May will focus on measurable outputs and outcomes. May 27th will have a recommendation with 2 to 3 strategies. Robin shared that a google form would be sent next week.

VI. **Adjourn, 4:45pm**

Public Comments:

**What values should be reflected in the work in the task force/commission work and in the recommendation for priorities?** Affordable Housing alliance for older adults/coalition; post affordable housing summaries; needs for older adults; strategic plan/stakeholder sessions on the 30th; they share values statement. Values Statement: Community-wide required; diversity, equity, inclusion; options/choice; data driven; age friendly; priority older adults, low income, most vulnerable; invest in what we currently have; collaborate and partner; sustainability; new revenue streams and expand existing

**What are 2-4 key insights from the reports the task force needs to consider?**
Administration: acknowledge importance of services and address barriers and efficient administration – bureaucratic systems, public money to build needs to accept voucher; regional collaboration; responsiveness to timelines; affordable for all; continuum of housing (include home ownership, home maintenance, needs of different group/constituents, diversity of housing geographic, scattered site and size) comprehensive service integration: healthcare, transportation, more transit access, workforce development and education, addiction services. Fund/funding authority: private/non-profit partnership with county and city; gap funding, county city land donations to non-profits to build housing, address zoning.

**Infrastructure:** focus on affordable housing, incentivize programs for property managers to address and get vouchers; more units for low income; county addressing property taxes, zooming changes for land use, infrastructure to allow more housing; land trust required affordability for 30 years; affordable housing that stays affordable; fund source: mandated from state, gap funding, line item in general funds, public/private partnership

**Improve Access:** identify who needs help in a timely manner; dedicated public funding source for affordable housing; ensure housing support; move into an all housing related on the different programs both public and private and make readily available

**Build More:** dedicated public funding source for affordable housing (County, City and State); continuum of housing for veterans, homeless, families, workforce development; extension of low income housing tax credit; zoning considerations/changes for housing
Identify Diverse Approaches: housing assessment what is the availability and need; comprehensive approach, continuum of housing

**Mitigate Impacts:** public awareness of offset nimbyism: local opposition

Next meeting April 1, 2022 from 2pm to 3:30pm, in-person

All meetings are recorded. Meeting agenda, materials and minutes are posted on the Affordable Housing Taskforce webpage at [http://www.pima.gov/HousingTaskForce](http://www.pima.gov/HousingTaskForce)

Please email Cassie.Lundin@pima.gov or call (520) 724-9638
Affordable Housing Task Force

GROUP 1
Improve Access to Affordable Housing
Data Snapshot

1. In what specific ways can government remove barriers?
2. Where are the bottlenecks/challenges in fast tracking for affordable housing?
3. What alternate strategies (supplemental income, childcare, food assistance, etc.) can improve access to housing?
4. How might we coordinate reduction of barriers to enhance access?

💡 Insights and Ideas Shared by Panel Members:

Support services must provide assistance well beyond the safety of housing, such as nutrition, employment, healthcare. Robust services to meet social determinants.

Consider efforts to attract more employers to create better paying jobs.

The Center for Neighborhood Technology (cnt.org) has done important research into the critical role that transit and transportation affordability plays in the overall family budget. They propose a housing + transportation affordability index.

What about weatherization/repair?

Although there is a need for construction of affordable housing, there is also a need for housing vouchers that match the current market. If a community just builds affordable housing, they will perpetuate the historical segregation that already plagues our community.

We need vouchers at a level that allows persons to live throughout Tucson, not just in pockets of poverty.

We need to use Section 8 to help find ways conventional apartments may want to participate.

What is the most important thing the task force must do to promote affordable housing?

Innovative systems change for affordable, accessible and equitable hsg 6
Fast tracking: developer incentives/reduce regulatory barriers 6
Dedicated public funding source for affordable housing subsidy 3
Donate/leverage land/structures (ie hotel, commercial, govt buildings) 2
Ensure housing supply matches needs, esp for low income pops 2
Public awareness to offset NIMBYism and local opposition 1
Define various levels of 'affordable housing' need and who they serve 1
Extension of Low Income Housing Tax Credits 1

*N = 16 respondents, some of whom suggested more than one important thing.
Source: Task Force google reflection for March 4 meeting
Key Insights and Data from Local Reports:

Eviction and Homelessness Prevention Task Force
The need for targeted reinvestment is more acute in neighborhoods where multiple vulnerability factors overlap with historic patterns of housing segregation and discrimination...By mapping measures of neighborhood vulnerability and access to opportunity, patterns emerge and highlight the need for geographically targeted strategies.

Pima Prospers: From June 2015 to June 2021, short-term rental listings in Arizona have increased 706%, showing just how much short-term rentals have exploded...cities could tax short-term rentals and use the funding to provide affordable housing.

Housing Affordability Strategy for Tucson
Include services not traditionally provided with Section 8 voucher programs such as housing search assistance, furnishings, limited supportive services, landlord incentives, and other aid to promote rapid entry and success.

Pima Prospers:
"Nonprofit organizations and community facilities play a vital role in the infrastructure of opportunity...building neighborhood resilience and connecting residents to services."

Peoples Communities and Homes Investment Plan
Tucson Voucher Programs Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Housing Choice Voucher</th>
<th>Veterans Affairs Supportive Housing</th>
<th>Family Unification Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vouchers Available: 4,798</td>
<td>Low-income individuals and families serves 636</td>
<td>Families and youth served by the Arizona Department of Child Safety that lack public housing offers 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population Served: -</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnering Agencies: Pima County: 327 vouchers administered by City of Tucson</td>
<td>U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs (VA)</td>
<td>Arizona Department of Child Safety</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Based Vouchers*</th>
<th>Housing Opportunities for Persons with AIDS (HOPWA)</th>
<th>Homeless Targeted Vouchers*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vouchers Available: 334</td>
<td>Persons living with HIV/AIDS serves 20</td>
<td>Persons experiencing homelessness offers 540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population Served: -</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnering Agencies: Private Landlords</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most Important (Central) Themes from all 5 Pima County Reports
with centrality bolded as connected to outlying concepts

- Strategic housing policy development
- Affordable housing assistance numbers
- Affordable housing gap analysis sales
- Strategic housing demand
- Low income and affordable housing supply
- Rent assistance

Keyword search of most central themes across all 5 reports, using topic model analysis: Govt Housing Admin Residential
Affordable Housing Task Force

GROUP 2
Build More Affordable Housing
Data Snapshot

1. Who should build what and where? How do we know? What do we need to know to answer these questions?
2. In what specific ways can govt remove barriers?
3. Where are the bottlenecks & challenges in fast tracking for affordable housing? What do we need to do to better understand them and address them?

💡 Insights and Ideas Shared by Panel Members:

Consider policies that will lead to more supply (increased density), reducing the costs (reducing fees), eliminating excessive regulations (starting with environmental), creating incentives (target investment zones)

To meet the current housing shortage and scale needed, market solutions will be needed. Would also be interested in any kind of market forecasting that might help not address current issues but prepare us for the next housing cycle or change.

Look at comparable communities (starting with the MAP Dashboard comparison communities) and identify some best practices

Expedite/fast tracking development code changes - building to meet growth and keep prices affordable (reducing impact fees/charges, reducing costs of city/county owned land for the purposes of building affordable housing, purchasing properties to be converted to affordable housing (offering developer incentives).

Extend affordable low-income housing tax credits

What is the most important thing the task force must do to promote affordable housing?

Innovative systems change for affordable, accessible and equitable hsg .......................... 6
Fast tracking: developer incentives/reduce regulatory barriers ........................................ 6
Dedicated public funding source for affordable housing subsidy .................................. 3
Donate/average land/structures (ie hotel, commercial, govt buildings) ......................... 2
Ensure housing supply matches needs, esp for low income pops .................................. 2
Public awareness to offset NIMBYism and local opposition ........................................... 1
Define various levels of ‘affordable housing’ need and who they serve ......................... 1
Extension of Low Income Housing Tax Credits ........................................................... 1

*N = 16 respondents, some of whom suggested more than one important thing.
Source: Task Force google reflection for March 4 meeting
GROUP 2 - Build More Affordable Housing

Key Insights and Data from Local Reports:

PimaProsper: "Build the missing middle housing. Find ways to incorporate small scale development into neighborhoods, flexible zoning, Accessory Dwelling Units, etc. Provide the resources and education, to put it into the hands of existing, local property owners instead of depending on developers to do all the work.

Making Action Possible for Southern Arizona
"As single-family housing construction took off between 2003-2006, there was a decline in multi-family housing development...multi-family housing development has rebounded since 2008...single family housing development has been slow since the housing crash of 2008”

Peoples Communities and Homes Investment Plan
12,000 units are available to low-income households. The demand for affordable units is far greater than the supply and more information on the affordable housing needs will be available in Phase 3 of the Housing Market Study: the Gap Analysis.

Housing Affordability Strategy for Tucson
Typical home values have increased at an even greater pace, from $176,199 in 2017 to over $287,000 this year. Household incomes are not keeping up with the rising costs of housing

Housing Affordability Strategy for Tucson - Housing affordability is needed for 75,000 hhs

Tucson MSA Building Permits Over Time

Most Important (Central) Themes from all 5 Pima County Reports with centrality bolded as connected to outlying concepts

- Strategic housing policy development
- Affordable housing assistance numbers
- Affordable housing gap analysis sales
- Strategic housing demand
- Low income and affordable housing supply
- Rent assistance

Keyword search of most central themes across all 5 reports, using topic model analysis: Govt Housing Admin Residential
Affordable Housing Task Force

GROUP 3
Mitigate Impacts on the Most Vulnerable
Data Snapshot

1. Which populations are most at risk?
2. Who are the most vulnerable & where do they live?
3. How much focus do we put on the most vulnerable? Why?
4. How do we mitigate impacts on the most vulnerable, while balancing other affordable housing needs?

Insights and Ideas Shared by Panel Members:

- Leverage existing land/structures (for example: empty hotels and commercial/office buildings including government buildings)
- Public awareness to offset NIMBYism and local opposition
- Housing First. Low barrier bridge housing to address homelessness. Less expensive than shelters and transitional housing with better outcomes. The model works because people are more competent than most charitable organizations know.

What is the most important thing the task force must do to promote affordable housing?

- Innovative systems change for affordable, accessible and equitable hsg 6
- Fast tracking: developer incentives/reduce regulatory barriers 6
- Dedicated public funding source for affordable housing subsidy 3
- Donate/leverage land/structures (ie hotel, commercial, gov't buildings) 2
- Ensure housing supply matches needs, esp for low income pops 2
- Public awareness to offset NIMBYism and local opposition 1
- Define various levels of 'affordable housing' need and who they serve 1
- Extension of Low Income Housing Tax Credits 1

*N = 16 respondents, some of whom suggested more than one important thing. Source: Task Force google reflection for March 4 meeting
Key Insights and Data from Local Reports:

**Eviction and Homelessness Task Force**
An estimated 11.9% of all Tucson households do not own a car...Tucson is the third-fastest warming city in the United States.

In 2019, Tucson had the third-highest rent price growth among western peer cities. The proportion of renters to homeowners has increased over time.

**Peoples Communities and Homes Investment Plan**

- **Pima County**
  - Food Insecure People: 138,699
  - Average Meal Cost: $3.19
  - Additional Money Required to Meet Food Needs: $72,678,000

Source: Feeding America®

**Analysis of Impediments**

**Peoples Communities and Homes Investment Plan**

Neighborhood Vulnerability Index illustrates recent 2018 5-year American Community Survey: the differing ability of members of particular socio-demographic groups to withstand threats to their livelihoods, security, and social, economic, and political networks.

**Making Action Possible for Southern Arizona**

- Strategic housing **policy development**
- Affordable housing assistance **numbers**
- Affordable housing gap analysis **sales**
- Strategic housing **demand**
- Low income and affordable housing **supply**
- **Rent** assistance

Keyword search of most central themes across all 5 reports, using topic model analysis: Govt Housing Admin Residential
Affordable Housing Task Force

GROUP 4
ID Diverse Approaches
Data Snapshot

1. Do we know where more diverse segments live/ want to live in order to avoid resegregation?
2. Where are our opportunities for mixed use/LT affordability given Pima County parcels available for development?
3. How do we address them?
4. How do we define affordable housing, by types of participants?

Insights and Ideas Shared by Panel Members:

- Serve all segments of the market
- “Attainable housing”
- Workforce housing rural and urban
- Service coordination supports
- Affordable housing for 50 to 120% of AMI Housing for single-parent families with minors
- Senior/elderly housing
- Homeless + mental health support for at risk individuals
- Youth
- Veterans who are at risk of being homeless
- Families
- Working age population without children
- Special needs

Community land trusts; co-housing models; sustainable options
Writing good RFPs for innovative proposals and tools to integrate needs such as low income, seniors, and special needs residents
Many programs, non-profits and quasi-government initiatives (like Pima IDA and Southern Arizona Land Trust) are doing things in the affordable housing space (for example, down payment assistance programs). Explore these and know what's worked and what hasn't.

What is the most important thing the task force must do to promote affordable housing?

Innovative systems change for affordable, accessible and equitable hsg
Fast tracking: developer incentives/reduce regulatory barriers
Dedicated public funding source for affordable housing subsidy
Donate/leverage land/structures (i.e hotel, commercial, govt buildings)
Ensure housing supply matches needs, esp for low income pops
Public awareness to offset NIMBYism and local opposition
Define various levels of ‘affordable housing’ need and who they serve
Extension of Low Income Housing Tax Credits

*N = 16 respondents, some of whom suggested more than one important thing.
Source: Task Force google reflection for March 4 meeting
Key Insights and Data from Local Reports:

**Peoples Communities and Homes Investment Plan**
Pima County in 2016 amended tiny home permitting policy...can be located on single-family and multi-family lots and in zones allowing Accessory Dwelling Units

**Analysis of Impediments:**
"61 census tracts where the percentage of people living in poverty exceeds 28.2% are considered areas of poverty concentration in Pima County"

Families may be able to send their children to a desirable private or charter school but may not have the transportation to make that a reality from their neighborhood. This limits educational options for children."

70% of manufactured housing units are located outside of Tucson.

**Housing Affordability for Tucson**
Many areas are experimenting with 3D-printed homes, including the City of Tempe where Habitat for Humanity just built the first 3D-printed home in Arizona.

City of Tucson’s City Home Advocacy Rehabilitation Modification (CHARM) programs offer repair and rehabilitation services for mobile homes, minor and major home repair, and lead paint abatement

Most Important (Central) Themes from all 5 Pima County Reports with centrality bolded as connected to outlying concepts

- Strategic housing **policy development**
- Affordable housing assistance numbers
- Affordable housing gap analysis **sales**
- Strategic housing **demand**
- Low income and affordable housing supply
- Rent assistance

Keyword search of most central themes across all 5 reports, using topic model analysis: Govt Housing Admin Residential