



Pima County
Workforce Investment Board

QUALITY JOBS. QUALIFIED WORKERS.

**Zoom Meeting of the Pima County Workforce Investment Board (“WIB”)
Virtual and Teleconferencing Attendance**

Planning Committee

Tuesday, April 30, 2020, 8:30 to 10 a.m.

Zoom Meeting Links:

Telephone: US: [+14086380968](tel:+14086380968),97093614770# or [+16699006833](tel:+16699006833),97093614770#

Online Meeting URL: <https://azbil.zoom.us/j/97093614770?pwd=aUpKRXBnNVJadDhWNIZMWEJaZ29PQT09>

Unique Meeting ID: 970 9361 4770

Password: 901312

The Unique Meeting ID is required to join the WIB Zoom meeting and if you are joining via telephone, you must use one of the **teleconferencing number** provided in the above link.

Meeting Minutes

Members Present

Danielle Duarte
Ian R. Roark
Michael Guymon
Liz Gulick
Laura Oldaker
Frank Velasquez, Jr.

Susan Hyatt Dumon
Kathy Prather
Molly Gilbert
Patti Greenleaf
Barbra Coffee

Members Absent

Aric L. Meares

Guests Present

Anna M. Cunes
Michael Gates
Tamara Nicolosi
Brad McCormick
Birni Stickell
Dan Sullivan
Julie Hecimovich

Marcelino Flores
Anthony Gimino
Daniel Howe
Nils Urman
Dr. Mark P. Vitale
Gina Pleas - on the phone

- I. **Called to Order:** Danielle Duarte, Chair, 8:33 a.m.
- II. **Zoom Meeting Protocols and Chat Moderator:** Mark P. Vitale, Chair, WIB Performance and Accountability Committee, reminded everyone to use the Chat feature, the meeting audio is being recorded, and to please mute microphone unless you want to speak, and asked everyone to sign in, in the Chat.
- III. **Local Workforce Development Plan 2020-2023 (“Local Plan”) Timeline:** Anna M. Cunes reported that the last communication from the State, was that since the State had

submitted the Arizona Plan 2020-2023 prior to the current pandemic due to the COVID-19 virus, the State wants local areas to submit Local Plans based on their original timeline as follows:

- Ongoing Development - 03/19/2020 to 04/16/2020
- Draft Local Plan to CSET Program Managers (“PMs”) for Review/Input - April 24
- Draft Local Plan to Key Stakeholders for Review/Input - April 27
- Review/Input due from CSET PMs and Key Stakeholders - April 30 and May 1
- Public Comment Period - May 5 to 19
- Local Plan Presentation and Adoption - May 8
- LCEO Board of Supervisors Approval - June 2020
- Submit to ADE and DES - July 1, 2020

IV. Economic Development Perspective: Danielle Duarte reviewed the information and discussions from the 04/28/2020 Planning Committee meeting.

V. In-Demand Occupations and Target Industry Sectors: Marcelino Flores presented on the following:

The WIB has identified target occupations within these groups that meet these criteria:

- Educational Requirements at Associate’s level and below,
- Median Wage at or above the median wage for the region,
- At least 10 projected openings per year and/or significant rate of growth,
- Additional target occupations identified based on overriding labor-market conditions.

The Local Plan 2016-2020 includes an analysis of 10-year occupational projections for the Tucson Metro Area that defines demand occupations within five broad groupings:

1. Healthcare/Health Sciences
2. Business Management, Operations, Support
3. Production/Aerospace/Defense/Security
4. Construction, Building/Grounds Maintenance, Installation, Repair
5. Transportation/Material Handling/Logistics

Ian R. Roark said that we invited the economic development organizations to get their input. We want to meet immediate job needs but that goes back to the WIB needing to look at sectors first and then the occupations.

Danielle Duarte provided the MAP dashboard link:

<https://mapazdashboard.arizona.edu/workforce-demographics-overview>

Ian Roark commented that looking at occupations is the exact opposite of an economic development paradigm.

Frank Velasquez, Jr. provided the links to the April 22 presentation conducted by Dr. George Hammond: <https://www.azeconomy.org/2020/04/outlook/arizonas-economy-a-bigger-shock-to-the-system/> and <https://www.azeconomy.org/data/forecast-data/>

Brad McCormick commented that he agrees with sector focus and then the workforce needs within the sector to build economic growth. How do you address the skills gap

currently within Pima County? Preparing the workforce to align with the sector growth for both business and career ladder for individuals.

Ian R. Roark replied that it makes sense and great point, Brad.

Kathy Prather commented that she believes that the key is stackable credentials. The workforce needs the basics but then the ability to upskill and pivot to new skills as new technology emerges. She agrees with the sector approach mentioned by Ian and stackability within pathways within priority sector.

Mark Vitale agreed that basic foundational skills are not unique sector to sector or job to job.

Ian R. Roark commented that if the aim is broadening the offering on the ETPL, we can still accomplish that with a sector approach via transferable skills. Approximately \$30K per year.

Frank Velasquez, Jr. asked Barbra Coffee is the livable wage in Tucson around \$16? I know the national livable wage is around \$17.16. I remember this being on the RFP for the City.

Barbra Coffee replied that the City of Tucson living wage is \$11.37 per hour with employer provided health insurance that pays 50% of the premium cost, or \$12.78 per hour if no health benefits are provided.

Frank Velasquez, Jr. replied to Barbra Coffee "Oh wow. I did not know it was that low, Barbra. I'm assuming that is for a single adult."

Tamara Nicolosi asked Barbra, how often is that wage evaluated?

Barbra Coffee replied that the information was from 2019 and the following is from the Pima County website: The current living wage rate for the 2020 calendar year is: \$13.12 per hour for employees who do not receive benefits; and \$12.00 per hour with \$1.12 in benefits for those employees who do receive benefits.

Ian R. Roark commented that he believes as a committee, we need to set the criteria and process, including for exceptions. When we get occupationally specific at the committee level we feel compelled to waiver on the strategy to meet immediate interests.

Nils Urman Machinists are on the ETPL and Pima CC does the training.

Ian R. Roark commented that the role of the Board and the Planning Committee is to set strategy for the system. Customer choice should be confined to the parameters of the regional strategy.

Nils Urman commented that everyone starts somewhere, but they don't start at the top.

Anna provided the following information that is on the current Pima County ETPL:

14376 Pima Community College District Machine Tool Technology – AAS

51-4012.00 Computer Numerically Controlled Machine Tool Programmers, Metal and Plastic 03/31/20 Re-Approved

Laura Oldaker commented that she knows the State also supports entrepreneurship.

Kathy Prather asked "What about Aerospace Manufacturing such as those that support Raytheon?"

Anna reminded attendees to please see the Agenda Item V. Action Item. A Committee member needs to make a motion if the Committee is going to approve the Sectors.

Ian R. Roark commented that Manufacturing and IT cross multiple sectors.

Daniel Howe commented that he agrees that we should have a conversation, however was Marcelino finished? He may cover some of this.

Anna reminded attendees that the current Local Plan has Aerospace & Defense ("A&D")-Manufacturing listed as a WIB target sector and the WIB may make a change to it or any other Sector as needed.

Nils Urman commented that he Sectors are defined by the WIB for the local area, based on local area economic and workforce data and needs. Career Pathways' occupations do cross Sectors.

Ian R. Roark commented that he believes that A&D-Manufacturing makes sense and Barbra Coffee said that commitment is awesome. Thanks, Ian for sharing that.

Ian R. Roark commented that he wanted to motion to keep the sectors the WIB has, with amending A&D to A&D-Manufacturing.

Nils Urman reminded attendees that A&D has always included Manufacturing and has been part of the sector all along. They fit very nicely.

Anna commented that the WIB should make updates to the sector descriptions because the WIB will be including this information in the Local Plan.

Susan Hyatt Dumon commented that she agrees that the WIB does need to wordsmith, but this vote is just approving those categories, right?

Mark Vitale confirmed that yes, just approving the sectors.

Nils Urman commented that ETPL is a moving target and adapts to the current Sectors needs.

Anna said she will email the Career Pathways Guidelines and current ETPL to everyone.

Ian R. Roark asked "May we adjust to self-sustaining wages? That will add more flexibility that staff were seeking, but keep it in sector and on pathways."

Anna replied that she will let him know the answer later due to self-sustaining requires many more factors than median wage.

Nils Urman agrees that the Committee should select and fine tune the Sectors at this time.

The following volunteered to help revise the Sector descriptions:

Health and Bioscience

Laura Oldaker
Michael Guymon

A&D-Manufacturing

Susan Hyatt-Dumon

Emerging Technologies

Laura Oldaker

Where Needed

Dr. Mark P. Vitale – not a Committee member but willing to help where needed
Ian R. Roark
Liz Gulick
Kathy Prather
Frank Velasquez, Jr.

- VI. Action Item:** The Workforce Investment Board (“WIB”) Planning Committee recommends approval by the Pima County WIB and adoption of the ARIZONA@WORK Pima County One-Stop Occupational Groups and the Occupations for Career Pathways; and giving the WIB Executive Committee authority to 1) make technical amendments based on feedback from the State and Partners; and 2) based on further guidance received from the U.S. Departments of Labor and Education. Not approved due to need for more decisions to be made and data to be confirmed. Committee will continue to determine local economic factors and make recommendations that will meet local employer workforce and training needs.

Anna reminded attendees that the WIB has identified target occupations within the industry groups that meet these criteria:

- ✓ Educational Requirements at Associate’s level and below
- ✓ Median Wage at or above the median wage for the region
- ✓ At least 10 projected openings per year and/or significant rate of growth
- ✓ Additional target occupations identified based on overriding labor-market conditions

Ian R. Roark reminded the attendees that "career pathways" is a term often used to justify entry-level positions with low wages being on the ETPL. However, we should look at how many of those low-wage entry-level worker actually make progress on the career pathway. Often times, we will find that they are two-job earners and don't have time to pursue training to climb out of the entry-level job. Equally, high-turnover should be another data point we look at. Is it a good investment of public dollars to send people into low-wage jobs with high turnover rates?

- VII. Action Item:** The Workforce Investment Board (“WIB”) Planning Committee recommends approval by the Pima County WIB and adoption of the Pima County WIB Target Industry Sectors; and giving the WIB Executive Committee authority to 1) make technical amendments based on feedback from the State and Partners; and 2) based on further guidance received from the U.S. Departments of Labor and Education. Ian R. Roark

motioned to keep the sectors the WIB has, with amending A&D to A&D-Manufacturing and including entrepreneurship under the Emerging Technologies Industry Sector. Michael Guymon seconded the motion; and all were in favor.

Anna reminded attendees that the WIB Planning Committee will engage in planning processes; determine local economic factors and make recommendations; develop strategic plans regarding local employer workforce and training needs; and assist the WIB in carrying out the WIOA-required Functions of the Local Board (WIOA Section 108).

Anna also reminded attendees that the WIB Performance and Accountability Committee reviews and reports all WIOA Service Providers' Performance and Required and Other Partners' Performance; oversees the development of Requests for Proposal ("RFP"); and (is supposed to) review/evaluate Eligible Training Provider List ("ETPL") requests and oversee the ETP's Performance.

Ian R. Roark commented that the Sectors (which we approved), framework, and process for exceptions. Also, the committee membership will change over time, so to meet our charge that Anna relayed, we need to have a framework and process that outlasts individual members.

VIII. Action Item: To approve the 04/28/2020 WIB Planning Committee Monthly Meeting Minutes. Liz Gulick motioned to approve; Laura Oldaker seconded the motion; and all were in favor.

IX. Next Meeting: Thursday, May 7, 2020 and May 21, 2020

X. Adjourned: 10:02 a.m.

