TODAY’S AGENDA

1. Introductions + overview
2. Breakout
   • Life maps
   • Small group convos
3. Task force roadmap
Clarifying our work.
Leveraging our expertise and experience.
Defining our process.

**WHAT**
This is the job you need to get done.

**WHY**
This is your passion.

**HOW**
This is your co-creation. Your unique way of getting the “what” done.
Clarifying our work.
Leveraging our passion, expertise and experience.
Defining our process.

WHAT is the job of the task force?
Identify evidence-based and promising practices that should be considered in Pima County and produce recommendations that will meaningfully increase availability of affordable housing within metro and rural Pima County.

Final Task Force Recommendations will include:
✓ STRATEGIES: Overall priorities/directions for how (process) and where (who/place) to act
✓ GOALS + OUTCOMES: Define what we are trying to accomplish and the desired results
✓ ACTIONS: Measurable, time-phased results that support the goals (with metrics and frequency)
Clarifying our work. Leveraging our passion, expertise and experience. Defining our process.

WHAT is the job of the task force?

1) What must this task force, as a group, accomplish by the end of May?

2) From your perspective, and leveraging your expertise and experience, what approaches, ideas or solutions should we explore?
Clarifying our work. 
Leveraging our passion, expertise and experience. 
Defining our process.

Survey: WHAT is the job of the task force? *

1) What must this task force, as a group, accomplish by the end of May?

- Begin to prioritize
- Create effective strategies and goals
- Evaluate + recommend best practices
- Establish governance

2) From your perspective, and leveraging your expertise and experience, what approaches, ideas or solutions should we explore?

- Consider what is feasible, viable, practical
- Build more + improve access to affordable housing
- Mitigate impacts on most vulnerable
- Consider different approaches by need – no “one size fits all”

*Method: Topic modeling = natural language processing-based text-mining tool to classify text to topics.
### 1) What must this task force, as a group, accomplish by the end of May?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dominant Topic</th>
<th>Topic % Contribution</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Subjective Label</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.9698</td>
<td>broadly, set, feel, force, process, expectation, would, outcome, early, concern</td>
<td>Setting arbitrary deadlines and expectations of outcomes this early in the process feels forced and I would be concerned it wont lead to substantive, meaningful or broadly supported concepts.</td>
<td>Be Cautious and Thorough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.9517</td>
<td>program, target, housing, identify, owner, funding, recommend, source, task, priority</td>
<td>Identify priority housing program targets with recommended funding sources and program task owners.</td>
<td>Begin to Prioritize</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.9347</td>
<td>need, identify, meet, community, priority, affordable, housing, substantive, would, process</td>
<td>Identify priorities needed to meet the community affordable housing needs.</td>
<td>Begin to Prioritize</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.967</td>
<td>identify, group, housing, adversely, affect, strategy, community, difference, meaningfully, could</td>
<td>Come up with solid strategies to help develop affordable housing where one stakeholder isn't the only group funding/absorbing any policies I was not in the first meeting so can not respond.</td>
<td>Create Effective Goals and Strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.9817</td>
<td>specific, objective, housing, policy, come, affordable, help, identify, need, first</td>
<td>Establish specific objectives for unit production with specific timelines and specific target populations, along with identifying resources needed to accomplish those objectives.</td>
<td>Create Effective Goals and Strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.9587</td>
<td>goal, measurable, set, review, realistic, outlined, outcome, convene, authority, approval</td>
<td>Outlined goals with realistic and measurable outcomes Develop a set of goals for submission to the convening authority for review and approval, or not.</td>
<td>Create Effective Goals and Strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.9261</td>
<td>high, goal, strategy, level, develop, implementation, idea, recommendation, seem, achievable</td>
<td>Develop high level goals and strategies with some Implementation ideas.</td>
<td>Create Effective Goals and Strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.9729</td>
<td>housing, address, affordable, affordability, govern, recommendation, structure, substandard, make, achievable</td>
<td>Improve housing affordability across Pima County by informing the County Boards actions and policies At the very least a thorough evaluation of the various best practice examples that effectively address affordable housing.</td>
<td>Evaluate and Recommend Housing Best Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.9609</td>
<td>housing, address, affordable, affordability, govern, recommendation, structure, substandard, make, achievable</td>
<td>Make achievable recommendations to address housing affordability, lack of housing inventory, addressing substandard housing, and displacement, etc.</td>
<td>Evaluate and Recommend Housing Best Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.9446</td>
<td>housing, address, affordable, affordability, govern, recommendation, structure, substandard, make, achievable</td>
<td>Also recommend a structure to govern the plan and provide affordable housing to the community.</td>
<td>Evaluate and Recommend Housing Best Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.9527</td>
<td>identify, group, housing, adversely, affect, strategy, community, difference, meaningfully, could</td>
<td>Commission to oversee progress, monitor market conditions, and promote projects, govern resources to create more housing Written Recommendations to Pima County.</td>
<td>Governance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### Natural language processing-based text-mining tool; Latent Dirichlet Allocation (LDA) is a topic modeling technique that classifies text to a particular topic. The analyst then applies a subjective label.
Housing Expansion

Market Forces

Until COVID is over, I prefer ZOOM Revisit general obligation bonds.

Identifying land for development, areas for collaborations A wide array.

All ideas should be discussed and explored.

Market Forces

Prioritizing and Planning

Promotes transparency in findings, so speeds the Improved Process

Dominant Topic | Topic % Contribution | Keywords | Text | Subtopic Label
--- | --- | --- | --- | ---
7 | 0.9277 | act, identity, need, reasonable, s, approach, fit, size, priority, datum | All ideas should be discussed and explored. | Be Reasonable and Do the Right Thing
7 | 0.9385 | act, identity, need, reasonable, s, approach, fit, size, priority, datum | Facts and data are needed to establish a baseline and identity priorities for where and what's reasonable to focus. | Be Reasonable and Do the Right Thing
7 | 0.8525 | act, identity, need, reasonable, s, approach, fit, size, priority, datum | There is no one-size-fits-all approach. | Be Reasonable and Do the Right Thing
6 | 0.8459 | housing, affordable, possible, need, project, provide, geographically, may, mixed, dispense | Discussion about goals (what possible and practical) would also shape what we hope to accomplish and when. | Developing Physical, long term goals
9 | 0.9757 | goal, realistic, set, resource, need, accomplishment, specific, present, plan, moves | Be specific in setting goals and realistic in resources needed to accomplish those goals. | Developing Physical, long term goals
9 | 0.9303 | available, wide, land, identity, development, collaboration, array, area, evaluate, investment | Identifying land for development, areas for collaborations A wide array. | Housing Expansion
9 | 0.7573 | housing, condition, barrier, build, affordable, solution, find, harm, historical, person | This should be implemented not only by decree, but through clear procedural changes to housing referral, application, approval, and leasing processes. | Improved Market Forces
7 | 0.9743 | market, explore, condition, make, discuss, definitely, discussion, want, relate, idea | We just want to make sure supply and demand and market conditions are included in the discussion since the lack of inventory in our market is definitely a factor directly related to the increase in home and rental costs. | Improved Market Forces
7 | 0.9727 | provide, state, modify, zoning, tax, creativity, use, potential, puzzle, allow | Obviously, these potential solutions are only a piece of the puzzle and we are seeing examples of other communities and states providing tax credits and modifying zoning codes that allow for more creativity in the development process. | Market Forces
7 | 0.9833 | housing, condition, barrier, build, affordable, solution, find, harm, historical, person | Fact finding to identify existing barriers for affordable housing and develop implementable solutions. From our perspective, we favor private sector solutions and have found some interesting examples that relate to streamlining the building of new houses and breaking down barriers to build more affordable housing, such as speeding up the permitting process. | Market Forces
4 | 0.9562 | housing, household, affordable, example, person, premature, physically, able, harm, die | For example, those persons/ house-holds most likely to be physically harmed or die prematurely if not able to obtain permanent housing. | Mitigate Negative Housing Outcomes
4 | 0.964 | housing, household, affordable, example, person, premature, physically, able, harm, die | In addition, we should take steps to reduce the probability that affordable housing will result in further segregation of households in our community based on race, ethnicity, and income. | Mitigate Negative Housing Outcomes
6 | 0.9819 | housing, affordable, possible, need, project, provide, geographically, may, mixed, dispense | Although construction of affordable housing projects may provide for the immediate and short term need for affordable housing, if they are not geographically dispersed throughout the county, and if there is not a plan for mixed-income use over time, it is predictable that these housing projects will further exacerbate the housing segregation that is already present in Pima County. | Mitigate Negative Housing Outcomes
3 | 0.9682 | housing, condition, barrier, build, affordable, solution, find, harm, historical, person | We should implement the Housing First and Harm Reduction models, removing historical judgement and discrimination of persons with conditions such as mental illness or addiction, which are both recognized medical conditions. | Mitigate Negative Housing Outcomes
9 | 0.9038 | prefer, general, bond, zoom, obligation, term, short, project, present, use | Until COVID is over, I prefer ZOOM Revise general obligation bonds. | NA
5 | 0.9794 | available, wide, land, identity, development, collaboration, array, area, evaluate, investment | I believe the taskforce should analyze available data regarding need within the various housing sectors, evaluate highest return on investment, review available funding sources, and make recommendations to involved governmental bodies as to setting priorities. | Prioritizing and Planning
6 | 0.9812 | housing, affordable, possible, need, project, provide, geographically, may, mixed, dispense | We should explore the available data to determine as best as possible how much affordable housing is ultimately needed in Pima County, along with clear prioritization of resources targeted to provide the most affordable housing possible as rapidly as possible, while prioritizing access to affordable housing by those most in need of that housing. | Prioritizing and Planning
7 | 0.9197 | housing, include, diverse, create, could, development, grant, identity, acquisition, choose | Looking at what was successful in other municipalities I was not in the first meeting so can not respond. | Study what has worked

Topic modeling* – promotes transparency in findings, so speeds the consensus building process.

2) From your perspective, and leveraging your expertise and experience, what approaches, ideas or solutions should we explore?
Clarifying our work.
Leveraging our passion, expertise and experience.
Defining our process.

Who are we and WHY are we here?

Life Map – How did you end up here today? (3 min)

Breakout Convos (25 min total)
- Introductions
- Round-robin share: 60 seconds/person to share your life map
- Craft group resume and mission statement
  - Resume = List your team’s top 5: experience and/or expertise you collectively offer
  - Mission Statement = We care about X, so we are here to do Y.
Clarifying our work.
Leveraging our passion, expertise and experience.
Defining our process.

Please add the following into the CHAT:

• **Team member names**
• **Team resume** = List your team’s top 5: experience and/or expertise you collectively offer
• **Team mission statement** = We care about X, so we are here to do Y
Howard will we identify recommendations to prioritize affordable housing and for whom?
Engage in participatory exploration process to collaboratively identify strategies that are desirable, feasible, viable.
Affordable Housing Task Force Road Map
February 18, 2022

**TODAY**

**Feb 18**
Who, Why, What, & How?

**March 4**
What is the terrain like? What do we need to know?

**March 18**
What pathways are desirable (offer outcomes we want)?

**April 1 + 15**
What are the viable and feasible strategies that achieve outcomes we want in the short, middle, and long term?

**April 29 + May 13**
How might we measure ongoing viability and feasibility through meaningful outcomes?

**May 27**
Recommend ~3 strategies to increase affordable housing

Final Task Force Recommendations will include:
- **STRATEGIES**: Overall priorities/directions for how (process) and where (who/place) to act
- **GOALS + OUTCOMES**: Define what we are trying to accomplish and the desired results
- **ACTIONS**: Measurable, time-phased results that support the goals (with metrics and frequency)
Affordable Housing Task Force Road Map
February 18, 2022

March 4
What is the terrain like?
What do we need to know?

Meeting 2: What is the terrain?
• Needs assessment and best practices
• Methods:
  • Documents review – natural language processing summaries back to group
  • Focus groups – natural language processing summaries- building on your lived experience

March 18
What pathways are desirable (offer outcomes we want)?

Meeting 3: What pathways and directions are desirable for this task force to explore at this time?
• Report back on task force members’ needs assessment and best practices
• Consensus building: Natural language processing correlation between research documents and task force priorities

Throughout meetings 2-3 we will work to identify values guiding direction of the charter.
Affordable Housing Task Force Road Map
February 18, 2022

Meeting 4 & 5: What are the viable and feasible strategies to reach our desired outcomes?

OUTCOMES = desired changes or benefits for the short, intermediate and long-term (see homework for samples)

• Move through outcomes-mapping process to ID stakeholders and map desired outcomes

• **Feasibility and viability questions:**
  • What are actionable/do-able?
  • Implementation: Which “tools” for action are affordable/expensive/prohibitive? (ie impact fees, inclusionary zoning, etc.)
  • How can task force/commission direct real change?
Affordable Housing Task Force Road Map
February 18, 2022

Meeting 6 & 7:
How might we measure *ongoing* viability and feasibility through meaningful outcomes?

- Review research and evidence-based strategies
- Machine learning/natural language processing to identify best practices, some potential benchmarking
- Define/refine direction of the charter
- Continue to examine correlation between task force priorities and research findings

**OUTCOMES** = desired changes or benefits for the short, intermediate and long-term (see homework for samples)

April 29 + May 13
How might we measure ongoing viability and feasibility through meaningful outcomes?
Affordable Housing Task Force Road Map
February 18, 2022

Deliverables
1. Final recommendations
2. Charter

Final Task Force Recommendations reporting framework will include:

✓ **STRATEGIES:** Overall priorities/directions for how (process) and where (who/place) to act

✓ **GOALS + OUTCOMES:** Define what we are trying to accomplish and the desired results

✓ **ACTIONS:** Measurable, time phased results that support the goals (with metrics and frequency)
Clarifying our work.
Leveraging our passion, expertise and experience.
**Defining our process.**

**NEXT STEPS:**

1. Participate in task force focus group
   (if possible, before next regular meeting on March 4)

2. Homework: Review sample outcomes maps on the following slides

If you have questions, feel free to email angie.donelson@gmail.com.
Feb 18 Homework – Pima County Affordable Housing Task Force

Review outcomes mapping processes for examples of the type of process work we will be doing to produce recommendations to meaningfully increase availability of affordable housing within metro and rural Pima County. Feel free to email angie.donelson@gmail.com with your questions!

Definitions within the following slides:

- **Outcomes** - Changes or benefits that occur in the short, intermediate and long-term as a result of your program(s) or initiative(s) efforts. These can occur at various levels (stakeholders, participants, neighborhoods, policy environment, etc) and be directed across place.

  - **Short term outcome** – Initial change, or the learning that occurs; changes in knowledge, awareness, attitudes, opinions, aspirations, motivations and skills.
  - **Medium term outcome** – Intermediate change, or the action that occurs; changes in decision-making, behavior, practices, or policies.
  - **Long term outcome** – Change in one’s status or conditions. Long-term outcomes are often referred to as impact. These can be changes in economic, civic, social or environmental conditions.
In the spring/summer of 2021, a 14-member community panel in Santa Cruz County worked to prioritize questions related to water related impacts important to explore before making recommendations to the global mining and metals company South32. Angie created the water issues decision map from outcomes mapping. It was used to frame deeper conversations and questions now guiding the panel. For the year end report, see this link.

[Diagram showing decision map]
SALT Stimulate/Strengths-Appreciate-Learn-Transform outcomes map
for more information about this project and Angie applied this outcomes framework in two peer reviewed research articles, see this link

**Program Elements (Process)**

**Activities**
- Pre workshop: Recruitment
- Community Opinion Leaders
- Workshop training and coaching
  - SALT Workshops, Coaching, Action
  - Plan Development & monitoring
- Action Plan Implementation & Oversight

**Participants**
- Individuals
  1) Health System: Facility Nurse and CHEW
  2) Community Opinion Leaders
    a) Chief Area Leaders administration/elders
    b) Women
    c) Youth
    d) Disability
  3) Local Business persons

**Outcomes**

**Short (LEARNING)**
- Participants become aware they are a community resource and agents of change
- Participants gain knowledge they can make change using what they have

**Medium (ACTION)**
- Participants apply knowledge and skills in goal setting, community action, and hands on project planning
- Participants gain knowledge they can make change using what they have
- Participants engage in future opportunities, including income generating activity to sustain health progress

**Long (CONDITIONS)**
- Participants gain knowledge they can make change using what they have
- Participants engage in future opportunities, including income generating activity to sustain health progress

**Individual outcomes: self interests fulfilled**

**Group outcomes: equity and mutual support**

**The group develops new networks to drive community opportunity**
- The group builds consensus to commit to long term planning
- Group builds improved local utilization of public health/health care resources
- Group gains increased trust of community for adoption of healthy behaviors
- Facility level health centers become engaged in solutions for patient centered care

**Theory of change assumptions:**

1) Community opinion leaders working with facility staff (nurse & CHEW) are the entry point for making change because they bridge community voice/adoption of healthy behaviors in the community
2) Leaders with whom we work are those with some training/leadership skills before starting SALT, essential for rapid community impact
3) Effective coaching through the SALT process is necessary for the group to move from process to impact outcomes
Multi-stakeholder outcomes map for Racial Equality and Community Policing (2021- Erik Hite Foundation)

**Goal:** Ambassadors to communicate ongoing practical, tangible efforts from and within our networks to build increased trust and encourage unity in our community by promoting racial equality and community policing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Network Activities</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Network convener</strong></td>
<td>Erik Hite Foundation, Pillars and Bridges, 4 Tucson, Tucson Metro and Hispanic Chambers, Jewish Federation of S AZ, Southern AZ Leadership Council, City of Tucson Mayor’s Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Churches</td>
<td>EHF Exec Director, Law enforcement community outreach personnel, mentoring programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P&amp;B volunteers, Police administration (deputy chief, sergeant)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Leaders in the business, nonprofit communities, local government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Short (LEARNING)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Medium (ACTION)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long (CONDITIONS)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness of P&amp;B expertise in creating process/feedback loops for open, honest dialogue for change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct informed trauma training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct informed trauma training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articulate criminal justice reforms needed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P&amp;B leader in network communications strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness of need to use, disseminate youth mentoring resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness of partners’ need to collaborate, act on own plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partners disseminate, use youth resources and mentoring programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partners report out on action plans, update and measure progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhanced capacity, responsiveness to racial equity and community policing strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racial equity and community policing strategies responsive to the needs of the community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal justice reform Improved trauma response</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model for other regions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated problem solving and action strategy for at risk youth and network collaboration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above displays a global picture of how the network meets the larger goals for racial equity and community policing.