MEMORANDUM

Date: June 17, 2021

To: The Honorable Chair and Members  
    Pima County Board of Supervisors

From: C.H. Huckelbeck  
    County Administrator

Re: June 12, 2021 Letter from the Pima County Deputy Sheriff Association Regarding Pay Increases for Sheriff Deputies

In response to the Pima County Deputy Sheriff Association (PCDSA) letter concerning pay increases, please see the following information.

1. The salaries provided in my June 7, 2021 memorandum to the Board of Supervisors were the current comparator salaries as of that date. All Arizona County comparators are relevant to a determination for the appropriate Deputy Sheriff wage. Currently, Maricopa County pays its Deputy Trainees $46,342 annually and Deputy Sheriffs at $51,584 annually. Contrary to PCDSA assertions, Maricopa County is not an outlier. A major contributing factor in salary for sworn law enforcement is not only the size of the city or county, but also the population it serves. Like Pima County, Maricopa County is responsible for over 9,000 square miles (9,224), yet has a population of 4,651,440 in comparison to Pima County of 1,068,730. This increased population would indicate a larger call for service volume and increase needs for patrol and detectives as well.

2. Currently, the County’s starting wage for a Deputy Trainee is $47,057 and upon successful completion of probation increases to $53,040. The current starting wage for Tucson Police Department (TPD) is $47,133. TPD has a proposed starting wage effective July 1, 2021, of $54,516.80. City of Tucson staff are unable to provide the proposed salary structure for the upcoming fiscal year until it is formally approved and published. As to the market in which we compete for applicants for this position, Town of Oro Valley has a current minimum annual pay of $50,559 for its Trainee and Officer positions and Town or Marana has a current minimum annual pay of $46,350 for their Trainee positions and $49,594 for their sworn law enforcement positions.

3. Identifying the 19.3 and 19.4 percentage increases for starting pay provided to Corrections Officers and Deputy Sheriff salaries respectively is accurate. While each employee may not have received the total 19.3 or 19.4 percent increase, to suggest that “some deputies received nothing” between Fiscal Year (FY) 2015/16 and FY 2019/20, is in error. Additionally, Human Resources data does not indicate that Corrections Lieutenants received a recent 25 to 40% increase, as the last increase noted for this classification was in September 2019, when the Board of Supervisors
approved a 2.0% compensation adjustment. Moreover, it is recommended that all employees identified below $15.00 per hour, to receive an increase of their wage to that amount effective July 2021, and is on the Board of Supervisor agenda for approval.

4. Increasing Deputy Sheriff pay by the Sheriff’s recommended amount of 10% would increase the annual minimum pay to $58,344. From a review of the comparators, such salary is not warranted. There are a handful of agencies who have a higher annual salary (Paradise Valley Police Department $62,505, Tempe $60,008, Chandler Police Department $54,434); however, these agencies have a compensation philosophy to lead the market competition; whereas, the County’s compensation philosophy is to match market competition. Matching market compensation is the most common approach in determining wages and is externally competitive.

5. The County does not have access to TPD’s proposed new pay scale, nor how an employee would move through the pay structure. It appears that for TPD there may be no pay difference between a Trainee and a new officer and they are paid the same. As such, the County’s pay for a new Sheriff Deputy is in line with the proposed new wage for TPD Officers ($53,040 vs $54,516), with the real discrepancy existing for how much a Trainee (Cadet) is paid. A review of Arizona agencies provide that 28 agencies provide for a Trainee/Cadet annual pay separate and apart from a Deputy/Officer annual pay, and 14 agencies pay both classifications at the same rate of pay. (Arizona Department of Public Safety Sworn Salary Survey Updated August 2020)

6. In a market-based job evaluation, the relative worth and pay structure of different jobs are based on their market value or the going rate in the marketplace. This method provides a rational and objective basis for determining proper salaries for law enforcement as the Deputy Sheriff position provides for easy job matching as the job-content is similar regardless of which agency employs the position. As such, looking at external data is important and it should not be limited solely to one organization, but several organizations with like comparisons to the County’s size, geographic location, community needs, and economic indicators.

Currently the Deputy Sheriff wages are competitive and there are no indications of a lack of applicants or being unable to fill current vacancies in a timely manner.

Attachment

c:  Jan Lesher, Chief Deputy County Administrator
     Cathy Bohland, Director, Human Resources
June 12, 2021

The Honorable chair and members of the Pima County Board of Supervisors:

We have obtained a copy of the County Administrator’s memo dated June 7, 2021, recommending that the Board vote against the wage adjustments advocated by Sheriff Nanos. We would like to set the record straight.

1) The first chart in Mr. Huckleberry’s memo contains only two agencies that, in our opinion, are justifiably comparable in size to the Pima County Sheriff’s Department (PCSD). They are: Tucson Police Department (TPD) and Maricopa County Sheriff’s Office (MCSO). Because MCSO’s primary function is providing jail services to the Phoenix metropolitan area, it remains an outlier and is not truly comparable to PCSD. In this county, your patrol and investigative deputies’ responsibilities range over 9000 square miles or an area larger than some states. Therefore, the closest analog to our patrol-focused mission is TPD. It’s critical to note, the TPD and the PCSD share the same candidate pool. Essentially, we compete for those within the Tucson Valley and typically not from distant communities.

2) The County Administrator is comparing salaries in ways that are misleading. For example, when arguing against the Sheriff’s recommended pay adjustments, Mr. Huckleberry is comparing TPD’s old wage structure to the one currently in place for deputies. This creates the illusion that PCSD deputies are receiving comparable starting wages. This is not true. In Pima County, the deputies currently start at $47,000/year, and the $53,000 number is not achieved (until after an 18-month training and probationary period). TPD officers will begin training with the city councils wage adjustments at $54,000 to start with and then over $60,000 after 18 months. We implore the Board to act and help Sheriff Nanos run a competitive agency. It is completely misleading when your deputies pay is compared to TPD’s old wage structure.

3) The County Administrator’s focus on average raises (expressed as percentages) are also misleading. First, a large percentage raise indicates that those adjustments were long overdue and impacted only the fringes of the problem. Some deputies received nothing during the period of time Mr. Huckleberry referenced in his memo. For example, lieutenants in the jail—not line level deputies—very recently
received raises between 25 to 40 percent, while the lower paid staff, many of whom are below $15/hour, were given nothing.

4) Contrary to Mr. Huckelberry’s memo, PCSD does not have the highest entry level pay. Our starting hourly wage for deputies is $22.62 during probation and $25.50 afterward. TPD’s current wage is $26.21 per hour (this is verifiable at TPD’s website and easily confirmed). Not surprisingly several in-state agencies pay rates were not listed. The Tempe Police Department starts its officers at $28.85. The Chandler Police Department starts at $26.71 and Yuma County deputies start at $25.02 per hour.

5) In his memo the listed information about TPD’s pay scale is also inaccurate. TPD’s new pay scale—effective in three weeks and the one we are competing with—has the following ranges:

   a. Officers’ – starting $54,516; mid-range $66,000; and topped out $77,500
   b. Sergeants’ – starting $86,673; mid-range $93,329.60; and topped out $96,012.80

6) While a “market value” analysis might have made sense in years past, the fact remains that we are trying to recruit and retain officers who are in direct comparison to The Tucson Police Department. That is our market, and we will lose to TPD every time if no adjustments are made.

On a personal note, we wish we could visit with each of you individually to explain our position and engage in a productive conversation. Unfortunately, the pandemic has had other plans for all of us. Until we can meet personally, we ask that you make your decision on the best available data and keep the hard-working men and women within the Pima County Sheriff’s Department competitive.

Collaboratively, we ask your help in building a better community with a more equitable and competitive county pay structure.

Respectfully,

All labor organizations within the Pima County Sheriff’s Department, including commissioned, corrections and civilian staff, stand together in agreement with the points made herein.

Chairman of PCDSA, Eric Cervantez

Vice Chairman of PCDSA, Ricardo Garcia
President of Fraternal Order of Police, Mark O’Dell

Vice President of Fraternal Order of Police, Lee Hays

President of Pima Corrections Association, Thomas Frazier

Vice President of Pima Corrections Association, Carlos Delgado

President of Pima County Correctional Officers Association, Michael Dominguez
MEMORANDUM

Date: June 7, 2021

To: The Honorable Chair and Members
   Pima County Board of Supervisors

From: C.H. Huckelberry
       County Administrator

Re: May 11, 2021 Letter from the Pima County Sheriff Deputy Association Regarding Pay Increases for Sheriff Deputies

As you may recall, at the Budget Public Hearing, the Sheriff requested a 10 percent salary increase for deputies. Some time ago, I significantly adjusted the starting salaries for deputies and also made a number of compression adjustments, the table below indicates the law enforcement compensation for all sheriff deputies in each County in Arizona as well as the City of Tucson Police Department (TPD).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Minimum Annual</th>
<th>Mid-Point Annual</th>
<th>Maximum Annual</th>
<th>Average Annual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pima County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$53,040</td>
<td>$60,596</td>
<td>$68,151</td>
<td>$59,454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apache County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$34,906</td>
<td>$43,633</td>
<td>$52,359</td>
<td>$36,564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cochise County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$41,000</td>
<td>$61,500</td>
<td>$82,000</td>
<td>$58,380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gila County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$48,806</td>
<td>$65,888</td>
<td>$82,970</td>
<td>$51,822</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graham County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$42,900</td>
<td>$54,665</td>
<td>$66,430</td>
<td>$50,534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Paz County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$44,782</td>
<td>$53,498</td>
<td>$62,213</td>
<td>$47,204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maricopa County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$51,584</td>
<td>$64,688</td>
<td>$77,792</td>
<td>$66,756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohave County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$42,598</td>
<td>$54,350</td>
<td>$66,102</td>
<td>$53,107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinal County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$51,164</td>
<td>$59,148</td>
<td>$67,132</td>
<td>$62,587</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Santa Cruz County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$40,189</td>
<td>$45,248</td>
<td>$50,379</td>
<td>$43,734</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tucson, City of</td>
<td>Police Officer</td>
<td>$47,133</td>
<td>$56,961</td>
<td>$66,789</td>
<td>$56,961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yavapai County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$48,540</td>
<td>$60,766</td>
<td>$72,992</td>
<td>$54,271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yuma County</td>
<td>Deputy Sheriff</td>
<td>$52,042</td>
<td>$67,143</td>
<td>$82,243</td>
<td>$54,870</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As you can see, the County’s starting salary for sheriff’s deputies is the highest in the State and the average annual salary is the third highest. The minimum mid-point average also competes well with those ranges for TPD with all four salaries being substantially higher than the City of Tucson Police Officer position.
In addition, Sheriff's deputies receive on-call pay at rates substantially greater than any other county. We recently surveyed the on-call pay provided by those other counties and found that the average on-call pay paid by Pima County is over two times the next highest amount of on-call pay.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>FY20/21 On-call Pay Budget</th>
<th>FY20/21 Eligible Staff Count</th>
<th>FY20/21 On-call Pay Per Staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pima County</td>
<td>$911,161</td>
<td>247</td>
<td>$3,689</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apache County</td>
<td>$40,000</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>$1,739</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinal County</td>
<td>$91,404</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>$1,143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yuma County</td>
<td>$14,000</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>$149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cochise County</td>
<td>$17,500</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>$117</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Finally, approximately one year ago I asked for a comparison of salary increases for all County employees in pay ranges associated with Sheriff deputies and correction officers, which is approximately $50,000 to $90,000 per year. Between Fiscal Year (FY) 2015/16 and FY 2019/20 the average County employee in that pay range received an average of 9.2 percent pay increase over those years. The average correction officer in that pay range received a pay increase of 19.3 percent and a deputy sheriff received a pay increase of 19.4 percent.

In addition to the considerations above, it should be remembered that the County will undertake a comprehensive salary survey in FY 2021/22 and appropriate consideration will be given regarding market compensation of both correction officers and law enforcement officers in this process. Until that time, I recommend no adjustments be made based on the previous facts.
May 11, 2021

The Honorable members of the Pima County Board of Supervisors:

As you are aware by now, the City of Tucson employees along with our brothers and sisters with the Tucson Police Department (TPD) will be receiving significant raises in the very near future. The Tucson City Council acted and approved the largest compensation package in city’s history for its employees. One of the motivating factors in raising salaries was the untenable position the Tucson Police Department was placed in. Perhaps not by choice but by forced staffing limitations, they are faced with limiting the call types they can respond to. The Pima County Sheriff’s Department (PCSD) and its members have always taken the position that “service” is critical in the idiom of; “to Protect and Serve”. The Deputy Sheriff’s Association members take great pride in the fact that we, when requested, respond to every call. For high priority calls, we are there in mere minutes.

Our association members share Sheriff Nanos’ concern that we may be faced with severe staffing issues if we are not compensated competitively with Tucson Valley’s law enforcement professionals. The ability to recruit and retain qualified men and women for law enforcement careers is challenging enough given recent national events. By adding a large pay disparity, we may be forced to operate with extreme staff limitations which may negatively impact service. In the early 2000s we lost more than twenty deputies - deputies who, at great expense to taxpayers, were fully trained and fully certified. This, during a few short weeks because of large pay increases for Tucson Police officers.

The PCSD is already short staffed and this community cannot afford further staffing shortages. TPD will now have substantially higher pay ranges compared to ours. If our wages are not competitive and we start losing law enforcement personnel, Pima County residents will suffer with compromised response times when life and death emergencies arise.

As the largest association within the PCSD and the only association with meet and confer rights, neither our members nor the Sheriff, want to be put in a situation where we can no longer respond to certain calls. This association supports Sheriff Nanos, and we are behind his plea to you. Our support staff, the deputy sheriffs and the corrections staff must remain competitive to attract viable employees.

Our plea is to simply ask that the BOS match TPD’s salary increases so we can retain the deputies that we currently have. We must continue to respond to any call that the community requests. We must continue to have the staffing to handle emergencies quickly and efficiently. This community relies on us and we hope to continue to be able to serve them any time they call on us.

Respectfully,
PCDSA