June 18, 2013

Acceptance of Canoa Architectural/Historical Review Committee Recommendations
Green Valley Medical Center
Co9-01-01 Pima County – Canoa Ranch Rezoning
Rezoning Condition #16J

Introduction

As the Board is aware, the Green Valley Medical Center, located to provide needed hospital services for the first time to the Green Valley and Upper Santa Cruz Valley area, is proceeding through the County’s development approval process. A key component of that process stems from the 2001 Canoa Ranch rezoning case: review by the Canoa Architectural/Historical Review Committee, which has now met three times and completed its work on the portion of the block to be occupied by the medical center.

The rezoning condition (#16J) states “A historical/architectural review committee, to be appointed by the Board of Supervisors, shall review site and architectural plans, including viewshed analyses, for all development east of Interstate 19. All development east of Interstate 19 shall be submitted to the historical/architectural review committee for review and approval to ensure that the development is designed to be architecturally harmonious in form, line, color, material and texture with the historic Canoa Ranch complex”.

The Board of Supervisors authorized at their November 20, 2012 meeting the appointment of the Canoa Ranch Historic/Architectural Review Committee. Those appointed were: Terry Majewski, Jon Mirro and Patsy Waterfall from the Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission; Dino Alfaro, David Yubeta and Jay St. John from the Canoa Ranch Community Trust Oversight Commission; Wayne Swan and Stacey Weak from the Pima County Design Review Committee; Stan Riddle and Bill O’Malley from the Green Valley Coordinating Council and Dr. Thomas Purdon, a Green Valley Physician.

As outlined below, a quorum of the Committee present voted unanimously to recommend approval of the aspects of the project it was tasked to review, after working with the site planner and architect on modifications from the original submittal. All committee members had input into the discussion and design over the three meetings the Committee held.

Background

The Canoa Ranch Historic/Architectural Review Committee is charged with reviewing each project within the Canoa Ranch rezoning area on the east side of Interstate 19.
Effectively, there is now only one block that is subject to this requirement. The first project to be subject to rezoning condition #16J, Green Valley Medical Center (development plan P1212-052), is roughly the south half of the one block and was submitted to the County for review on December 24, 2012.

The Committee first met on January 30, 2013 where staff gave an overview of the agenda, discussed Open Meeting Law and Conflict of Interest and the scope of the review Committee as required by rezoning condition #16J.

Linda Mayro, Director of our Conservation and Sustainability Office, provided detailed information regarding the Pima County Canoa Ranch Master Plan.

The project manager and project architect presented the preliminary architectural renderings they had for the project to the committee. They described the site, building colors, materials and heights. Committee members had questions regarding total number of beds, equipment and parapet walls, perimeter walls and the helipad, which were answered by the architect.

The second committee meeting was held on March 5, 2003 where the architect discussed the exhibits and handouts that were provided at the meeting and previously sent via email. He stated that the hospital and two medical office buildings were the only ones to be built initially; and that once the other buildings were designed and ready to be constructed, they would be presented to the Committee.

The architect provided 3-D architectural model renderings describing the vantage points from which the pictures were taken to show the minimal impact on the view to the mountains. He also provided shots of several vantage points taken from the Historic Canoa Ranch and DeAnza Trail to show the impact from the ranch.

Form and line, color, material and texture were all discussed and addressed. Although none of the buildings are white like those of the historic ranch, the proposed color scheme takes cues from the surrounding landscapes and blues in the mountains; and the multicolor concept helps the buildings blend with the environment and surrounding landscape in the area. There was a concern from several of the Committee members that the colors were somewhat bold and not really earth tones, while another member was concerned the stone was being over used. The architect indicated they would look into reducing the use of stone and come back with alternatives. Again, a member asked the architect to provide some low perimeter walls, particularly along the I-19 frontage.
Mr. Bill O’Malley moved to approve the site design subject to review of low site perimeter walls and to tentatively approve the conceptual design subject to further review of colors, stone material and the core and shell package. The motion was seconded by Mr. Jon Mirto, and the motion passed unanimously. (Committee members Jay St. John, Patricia Waterfall, Wayne Swan and David Yubeta were absent).

The final meeting was held April 1, 2013 where the architect presented the Committee with four color scheme options, several stone color and texture options, and a perimeter wall concept. The architect provided large color swatches of the four color schemes proposed for the buildings and discussed the various options, including switching out one color for another from the various color schemes. The Committee agreed on the “muted color scheme” rendering, which consists of Dunn Edwards’ paint colors Soft Pumice, Battle Harbor, S’mores, and New Cork, all with a Light Reflective Value of less than 35 percent. The Committee agreed on Slate Grey for the roof color.

Of the various stone form and texture options presented, the stone design chosen was the Old World Ledgestone in Summerlin Blend.

The perimeter wall is to be a lighter muted color than the rest, Dunn Edwards’ Crisp Muslin with a Light Reflective Value of 71 percent.

The Committee also discussed the ramada structures and concluded their construction would include stabilized granite.

After no further discussion, it was moved by Mr. Stan Riddle and seconded by Mr. David Yubeta to approve the perimeter wall concept as shown. The motion passed unanimously. (Committee members Jon Mirto, Dino Alfaro, Wayne Swan and Stacey Weeks were unable to make this third meeting).

A motion to approve the ramada structure concept as shown was made by Ms. Terry Majewski and seconded by Ms. Patsy Waterfall. This motion also passed unanimously.

A motion to approve the “muted color scheme” as presented was made by Dr. Jay St. John and seconded by Mr. Riddle. Again, the motion passed unanimously.

A motion to approve the site was made by Mr. O’Malley and seconded by Mr. Riddle, and the motion passed unanimously.

I concur with the Committee’s recommendations as outlined above.
The Honorable Chairman and Members, Pima County Board of Supervisors
Acceptance of Canoa Architectural/Historical Review Committee Recommendations
Green Valley Medical Center
Co9-01-01 Pima County – Canoa Ranch Rezoning
Rezoning Condition #16J
June 18, 2013
Page 4

Recommendations

I respectfully request the Board of Supervisors accept the following recommendations of the Canoa Architectural/Historical Review Committee regarding the development of the Green Valley Medical Center:

1. Approval of the Concept Site Plan as shown in Attachment 1.
2. Approval of the Site Wall Concept and Color as shown on Attachment 2.
3. Approval of the Project Color Scheme as shown on Attachment 3.
4. Approval of the Stone Material as shown on Attachment 4.
5. Approval of the Shade Structure Concept as shown on Attachment 5.

Respectfully submitted,

C. Huckelberry
C.H. Huckelberry
County Administrator

CHH/mjk – June 5, 2013

Attachments
c: Canoa Architectural/Historical Review Committee Members
   Arlan Colton, Planning Director, Development Services
   Linda Mayro, Director, Conservation and Sustainability
   Frank Thomson, Planning Consultant
   Mark Bollard, Architect, Swaim Associates Architects
view from I-19 northbound

view from I-19 southbound
GREEN VALLEY MEDICAL CENTER
4455 S 1-19 FRONTAGE ROAD
GREEN VALLEY, AZ 85614

west elevation
N.T.S.

north elevation
N.T.S.

rendered elevations
GREEN VALLEY MEDICAL CENTER
4455 S 1-19 FRONTAGE ROAD
GREEN VALLEY, AZ 85614

view from orientation center at Canoa Ranch (north of lake)

view from heritage area of Canoa Ranch (north of Manning houses)
GREEN VALLEY MEDICAL CENTER

4455 S 1-19 FRONTAGE ROAD
GREEN VALLEY, AZ 85614

view from Anza trail (north of ramada)

view to Canoa Ranch building complex from Anza trail

view through Anza Trail ramada to east (north of Canoa Ranch complex)
GREEN VALLEY MEDICAL CENTER

4455 S 1-19 FRONTAGE ROAD
GREEN VALLEY, AZ 85614

site section: west to east
N.T.S.

section perspective from west property line
N.T.S.

Approved Colors and Materials:

EIFS:
Landscape walls: Dunn Edwards Crisp Muslin DE6212

enlarged section perspective - monument sign
N.T.S.

approved site wall concept
Approved Colors and Materials:

**EIFS:**
- Building walls: Dunn Edwards colors (samples at right)
- Landscape walls: Dunn Edwards Crisp Muslin DE6212

**Stone:**
- Coronado Old World Ledgestone in Summerlin Blend

**Roof Screens:**
- MBCI Slate Gray

**Stair Towers:**
- EIFS accent color, not stone

Dunn Edwards
- Soft Pumice DE6326 LRV 31
- Battle Harbor DE6257 LRV 30
- S'mores DE6111 LRV 23
- New Cork DE6180 LRV 33
GREEN VALLEY MEDICAL CENTER
4455 S 1-19 FRONTAGE ROAD
GREEN VALLEY, AZ 85614

Old World Ledgstone in Summerlin Blend

Old World Summerlin Blend Installed

approved stone
GREEN VALLEY MEDICAL CENTER
4455 S 1-19 FRONTAGE ROAD
GREEN VALLEY, AZ 85614

Lookout ramada along meditation path

approved shade structure