



**PIMA COUNTY ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY ADVISORY COUNCIL**  
**33 N. Stone Avenue, Suite 700**  
**Tucson, AZ 85701**

Summary Minutes – September 15, 2010  
Bank of America Building, Conference Room, 7<sup>th</sup> floor  
33 N. Stone, Tucson, AZ  
1:30 p.m.

Members Present:

Dr. Eric Betterton  
Mr. Curt Lueck  
Dr. Roger Caldwell  
Mr. Allan MacDonald  
Mr. Peter Livingston  
Dr. Mark Witten  
Mr. Warren Thompson  
Mr. Jeff Yockey

Members Absent:

Mr. Ben Dorris  
Mr. Daniel G. Rowe

Others Present:

Ursula Kramer, Director, PDEQ  
Richard Grimaldi, Deputy Director, PDEQ  
Lesley Lukach, Pima County Deputy County Attorney  
Vicki Bennie, Council Secretary, PDEQ  
Susanne Cotty, PAG  
Roxanne Linsley, ADEQ  
Jim Glock, Director, City of Tucson DOT  
Kurt Hough, Transportation Administrator, City of Tucson  
Richard Garb, City of Tucson DOT  
Dr. Paloma Beamer, Asst. Prof., UA College of Public Health  
Dr. Miranda Loh, Asst. Prof., UA College of Public Health

**I. CALL TO ORDER AND INTRODUCTIONS**

Mr. Thompson called the meeting to order and introductions were made.

**II. APPROVAL OF THE MAY 19, 2010**

A motion was made by Dr. Witten, seconded by Dr. Betterton, to approve the minutes as written. The motion passed unanimously.

**III. HOUSE BILL 2209 (OPEN MEETING LAW CHANGES)**

Ms. Lukach, Deputy County Attorney, is counsel to the Department of Environmental Quality. She is the supervisor for the Land Use and Environmental Unit of the County Attorney's Office. Ms. Lukach provided a handout that summarized the changes to the open meeting law that apply to EQAC and Pima County. Some of the changes only apply to cities and towns. The changes that apply to EQAC are:

- New requirement in A.R.S. § 38-431.01 that the Clerk of the Board post open meeting law material prepared by the Arizona Attorney General on the County's website and that

**III. HOUSE BILL 2209 (OPEN MEETING LAW CHANGES- CONTINUED)**

any person appointed to a public body review the material (previously the Clerk was just required to give the material to the appointees).

- New requirement in A.R.S. § 38-431.02 to both conspicuously post a statement on the website (webpage) saying where the notices of the meeting will be posted and to post notices of their meeting on their website (webpage).
- Change to A.R.S. § 38-431.02 that clarifies requirement that specific statutory authority for an executive session be included in the notice of the executive session.

**IV. STREET CLEANING AND AIR QUALITY**

In July, Dr. Dale Keyes, former member of EQAC, wrote a letter to the Council regarding the negative impacts of street sweeping on air quality.

Mr. Glock, Director of City of Tucson Department of Transportation, spoke to Dr. Keyes and agreed to provide information about the City's street sweeping program.

Kurt Hough, Transportation Administrator for the City of Tucson Department of Transportation, used a power point presentation (attached) to demonstrate the methods used to ensure that they remain PM10 compliant and meet environmental standards. Mr. Hough stated that the City of Tucson, DOT Streets and Traffic Maintenance Division is always conscientious of dust control in all of its operations. This issue is on their mind most when they are sweeping the streets of Tucson.

While the street sweepers meet the PM10 requirements, the Tucson DOT added a spray bar to the front of each sweeper, increasing the amount of water being applied to further reduce dust emissions.

The side sprayers, along with the front spray bar, allows them to cover a more complete area in the pathway of the sweeper, ensuring dust is kept to a minimum.

Operators are trained to use the proper pressure and tilt of the gutter broom to match the contours of the road surface thus flicking debris into the sand board to be guided into the main broom. This also prevents dust agitation.

The main broom also has a spray bar in front of it which further prevents the raising of unnecessary dust. The main broom's four to six inch pattern flicks the debris into the elevator for collection. This picture shows the water pattern used by the entire system.

When sweeping areas with heavy accumulations, they bring in a water truck and loader to remove the debris before sweeping to prevent heavy dust from being raised.

In the past, they would use a belly dump sweeper to dump debris on the ground which would then be picket up with a loader and a ten-yard dump truck which created more dust. Now, they dump their sweeping debris directly into dump trucks and have the equipment operators pay close attention to the dumping to make certain it is damp enough to prevent the raising of any dust.

**IV. STREET CLEANING AND AIR QUALITY (CONTINUED)**

Dr. Keyes' raised the following questions in his letter:

*Dr. Keyes' Question:* With Pima County facing possible violations of the EPA particulate matter standards, why is Tucson deploying an air quality control method that appears to be increasing levels of airborne particulates?

*City DOT Answer:* When purchasing sweepers, we ensure that the new equipment meets the "PM<sub>10</sub> Requirements", in accordance with the environmental standards. PM<sub>10</sub> is the abbreviation for Particular Matter with a diameter of less than 10 microns in size.

*Dr. Keyes' Question:* With the City of Tucson facing severe budget restrictions, why is it wasting money and labor resources on an ineffective service?

*City DOT Answer:* At this time, our sweeping practices have not proven to be ineffective. It has been quite useful in regards to keeping bike routes free of debris and main arterials free of accumulations. Our sweeping practices allow us to meet the goals of sweeping the City twice per year. This enhances the beautification of City roadways while providing a safe and clean roadway to the traveling public.

The EPA and ADEQ have determined that street sweeping is an important best management practice for the control of pollutants in stormwater runoff. Heavy metals released from vehicular traffic bind the sediments and contribute to stormwater pollution. Street sweeping removes these sediments and the heavy metals associated with them, thereby preventing stormwater pollution. Street sweeping is a required element in the City's municipal stormwater permit. Quantities of debris removed are reported in the City's Stormwater Annual Report and are directly credited to improvements in stormwater runoff.

The City has established a standard of street sweeping major arterial and collector streets twice monthly, and sweeping the central business district three times a week.

In addition to routine street sweeping, City DOT sweeps in response to special events such as storms, Rodeo Parade and the Fourth Avenue Street Fair.

Mr. Hough stated that they train their sweeper operators to periodically check the sprayer tips to ensure that all of the spray systems are working properly before and during sweeping. They are trained to take corrective action as needed. Additionally, operators are trained to periodically check the brooms and sand board to ensure proper adjustments. Operators are also instructed to closely monitor the water levels in the sweeper's tanks and not allow operation when the tank is empty. All of this is done to make sure that environmental standards are met and compliance is maintained.

There was consensus to have staff draft a response letter to Dr. Keyes from EQAC containing the key points from the presentation.

**V. OZONE REPORT**

Ms. Kramer stated that EPA has delayed the revision of the ozone standard until the end of October. About a year ago, the standard was revised to .075 PPM and the new revision is expected to be lower. EPA is looking at previous recommendations for this standard; no new research is being done at this time.

There was consensus to make Ozone a continuing topic for EQAC and a central topic for the November meeting.

**VI. PDEQ STAFF REPORT**

Ms. Kramer reported on both the Environmental Quality and Solid Waste Divisions of PDEQ.

Environmental Quality Division

ASARCO update – Ms. Kramer stated that staff continues to work with ASARCO on a settlement for the Notices of Violation issued.

Solid Waste Management Division

- The Ina Road Landfill temporarily closed on June 30, 2010 and tires are now accepted at the Tangerine Landfill.
- The Sahuarita Landfill remains open after the public suggested an increase in tipping fees which the Board of Supervisors approved.
- Staff is looking into the possibility of a transfer station at the Tangerine Landfill location. Due to the downturn in the economy, the Tangerine Landfill did not reach capacity as expected and remains open.

**VII. CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Mr. Thompson made a call to the audience.

Ms. Cotty of PAG provided the following information:

- PAG completed an update to the greenhouse gas inventory which has been sent out for comment. Greenhouse gas inventories have also been done for Marana, Oro Valley and Sahuarita and are posted on the PAG website.
- At the PAG AQS meeting on September 21, an EPA representative will be attending the meeting to discuss particulate matter issues.
- PAG continues to discuss ozone with ADEQ, PDEQ and MAG.

Ms. Linsley of ADEQ provided the following information:

- All state websites have been modified to comply with the Government Information Technology Agency (GITA) requirements. Please call if you have questions.

**VIII. NEXT EQAC MEETING (NOVEMBER 17, 2010) AND AGENDA ITEMS**

The next EQAC meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, November 17, 2010, at 1:30 p.m. in the PDEQ conference room, 33 N. Stone, Suite 700, Tucson. Agenda items are:

- Approval of Minutes
- Staff Report (EQ and SW Divisions)
- Ozone – Discussion of EPA's new standard
- PDEQ Monitoring Program presentation
- ASARCO update

**IX. ADJOURNMENT**

Having completed all meeting agenda items, the Council adjourned.