

Minutes of the Fort Lowell Restoration Advisory Committee Meeting

5230 E. Fort Lowell Road, Tucson, Arizona 85712

March 10, 2010, 5:00 P.M.

1. Call to Order

Meeting called to order at 5:06 p.m. A quorum of the Committee was present. Those in attendance were:

Elaine Hill (acting as Committee Chair)

Peggy Sackheim (Committee Member)

Patsy Waterfall (Committee Member)

Frank McClure (Committee Member)

Jim Conroy (City of Tucson)

Jonathan Mabry (City of Tucson)

Lynne Birkinbine (City of Tucson)

Lisa Cuestas (City of Tucson)

Simon Herbert (Pima County)

Loy Neff (Pima County)

Corky Poster (Poster Frost Mirto)

Drew Gorski (Poster Frost Mirto)

Pat Hartshorne (SCS Engineers)

Bill Anderson (OFLNA)

Al Paunus (Resident)

Bob Jones (Resident)

Tamiyo Morishita (Resident)

Barry Spicer (Resident)

2. (Action) Review of Meeting Minutes: November 18 meeting

Peggy Sackheim moved to approve the minutes of the November 18 meeting. Patsy Waterfall seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

3. Work Plan: Project Status Reports.

a. COT, Project Status Updates

i. EPA Grant Environmental Clean Up Project.

Lynne Birkinbine reported on the status of the EPA Grant Environmental Clean Up Project. Project scoping is in progress in cooperation with environmental consultant, SCS Engineers. COT has obtained cost estimates from two archaeological consultants for the required monitoring and treatment of any impacted cultural resources. COT will choose Desert Archaeology, based on preliminary proposal and cost estimate, but costs are higher than anticipated. To address the higher than anticipated total costs, COT will use a phased approach to conduct the clean up, with the first phase focusing on the southern portion of the Adkins property, followed by work in the northern portion, to assist the implementation of the Preservation Plan. The first phase of clean up is scheduled to begin in October, 2010. Birkinbine distributed a map showing the division of the project area into northern and southern portions.

COT will issue the Notice to Proceed to the selected archaeological consultant, Desert Archaeology, within a month. Desert Archaeology will prepare a Treatment Plan for the monitoring that addresses the unique needs of the clean up and anticipated archaeological and historic resources in the project area. COT and SCS Engineers will prepare a Feasibility Study, incorporating Desert Archaeology's Treatment Plan, for submittal to EPA, ADEQ, and SHPO for review and approval before the clean up begins.

A phased approach to the clean up will allow funding to be identified separately for the south and north portions of the Adkins property. Adequate funding is in place to complete the south portion first. This approach will allow the implementation of the Fort Lowell Master Plan and Preservation Plan to proceed in sequence with the clean up phasing, with most of the required preservation work focused on the Officers Quarters in the southern area. Preservation work can proceed in the southern portion concurrently with the clean up in the northern area.

The Committee Chair allowed questions from the Public during the presentation.

Barry Spicer asked if the clean up will avoid disturbing native plants on the property. He was particularly concerned about mesquite trees that are potentially old enough to have been present during the Fort era. Birkinbine and Jonathan Mabry explained that the consultants working on the clean up will avoid impacting native plants. Loy Neff added that the contaminated soil removed will be replaced by clean fill, and can be replaced around tree roots, etc., to ensure protection.

Mr. Spicer also asked about efforts to limit contamination by non-native plant species brought into the project area on equipment and/or vehicles. Birkinbine and Jim Conroy explained that COT and its consultants will employ protective measures to prevent contamination by cleaning vehicles before entering the Adkins properties to remove any vegetation or seeds. Vehicles and equipment also will be cleaned before leaving the work site to prevent transporting environmental contaminants away from the project area. These are standard COT procedures in maintaining properties with native vegetation, and standard procedures for environmental clean ups.

Elaine Hill asked about the nature of the fill mentioned by Neff and what measures will be taken to prevent contamination brought in with the fill, such as plant materials and archaeological materials. Conroy explained that COT employs a program of identifying and obtaining fill from uncontaminated sources and will monitor the fill operation to prevent contamination by outside environmental, plant, or cultural materials.

ii. No other COT updates.

b. County Project Status Updates

i. Adkins Parcel – Demolition Project

Corky Poster and Andrew Gorski reported on the Demolition Project status. Planning is complete and the project status includes late-stage preparation of materials for submittal to reviewing agencies, such as the Fort Lowell Historic Zoning Advisory Board, COT Zoning Administrator, and SHPO. Submittals will include copies of the Adkins Parcel Demolition Plan, Adkins Parcel Selective Demolition Historical Documentation Report, and Archaeological Monitoring Plan. The Demolition Plan was presented to the Committee, and the buildings and structures scheduled for removal were identified. The draft Historical Documentation Report was circulated for brief review and given to Neff and Simon Herbert for formal County review. This document includes measured drawings, photographs, and descriptions of the buildings and structures to be removed as well as the results of additional historic research about the buildings, in particular, the Magor House. The Monitoring Plan has been reviewed and approved for submittal by Pima County. When all three documents are finalized, they will be available to the Committee and placed on the project website for public access.

Gorski and Poster also explained the salvage component of the Demolition Project, in which selected materials of historic significance or other interpretive use will be removed and stored by COT until an interpretation plan is completed to guide their use in exhibits and interpretive re-use as later phases of the Fort Lowell Master Plan are implemented. Herbert explained that it will not be possible to make salvaged materials available to the public during the demolition because of contractual reasons (the contractor will recycle and/or re-use selected materials at their discretion), public safety issues on site, and environmental contamination issues. Herbert suggested the possibility that the consultant might make salvaged materials available for sale on their premises.

The Demolition Project is on schedule. All necessary reviews and approvals will be completed during the Spring of 2010 and demolition work will begin by early June, 2010. The Demolition Project will be complete by Summer, 2010. Design and Procurement for implementation of the Fort Lowell Preservation Plan will proceed concurrently so that construction can begin in the southern portion of the Adkins Parcel after the environmental clean up is complete.

The Committee Chair allowed questions from the Public during the presentation.

Based on the premise that all the buildings and structures are historically important, Bob Jones asked how review bodies can be “persuaded” to approve the removal of historical buildings from a Historic District.

Mabry responded by explaining that the characteristics of buildings in an historic district can be identified and they can be evaluated as contributing structures or non-contributing structures to the historic significance of the District. With appropriate supporting evidence, non-contributing structures can be removed without negatively impacting the overall integrity of the Historic District. Poster added that the justifications for considering a structure a non-contributor can be presented during the review process and this issue is addressed in the previously mentioned Historic Documentation Report. He reminded the group that the rationale for considering the National Register status of buildings and structures on the Adkins Parcel has already been presented in the review process for the Fort Lowell Master Plan and Preservation Plan. All reviewing bodies have approved the content of both plans, including the Fort Lowell Advisory

Committee, the Fort Lowell Historic Zoning Advisory Board, the Old Fort Lowell Neighborhood Association, COT Zoning Administrator, SHPO, and other reviewing bodies. Neff remarked that the cultural resources compliance process accounts for preservation of National Register-eligible properties, but it also allows for impacts and even destruction of eligible properties if adequate mitigation treatments are approved and applied. An example of such mitigation is data recovery excavation of portions of eligible archaeological sites before construction damages or destroys the resources. In the Fort Lowell case, mitigation documentation of historic buildings and structures has been completed.

ii. No other County updates

4. New Business

a. No new business.

5. Call to the public – no public questions or comments (Public input was allowed during the Project Status Updates).

6. **(Action)** Items and schedule for the next meeting.

a. Schedule for future meetings at San Pedro Chapel – Neff discussed schedule items and options for meetings, including continuing with a monthly schedule, changing to a quarterly schedule (which had occurred for the present meeting by virtue of cancelled meetings in December, January, and February), or individually scheduled meetings. Discussion among committee members and staff identified future project updates as the primary meeting topics and explored scheduling options that would adequately accommodate reporting needs. Discussion resulted in the recommendation to proceed with a quarterly meeting schedule, which will allow the Committee to participate in the Design phase of the Preservation Plan. It was agreed that Neff will provide regular project updates to the Committee, and that “emergency” meetings can be called, if needed, to address any important issues that arise between quarterly meetings.

Elaine Hill moved that the next quarterly meeting be scheduled for June 9, 2010. Peg Sackheim seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

7. Meeting adjourned at approximately 5:40pm.